



**BEFORE THE DISCIPLINARY COMMITTEE OF PAKISTAN MEDICAL & DENTAL
COUNCIL**

In the matter of

Complaint No. PF.8-1891/2019-DC

Mr. Muhammad Yaqoob against Dr. Abida Yasmeen (12964-P), Dr. Sadiya Maqsoom (67438-P),
Dr. Samiaa Rasheed (65273-P)

Prof. Dr. Muhammad Zubair Khan	Chairman
Barrister Ch. Sultan Mansoor	Secretary
Prof. Dr. Mahmud Aurangzeb	Member (online)
Mr. Jawad Amin Khan	Member (online)
Expert of Gynecology	

Present:

Mr. Muhammad Yaqoob	Complainant
Dr. Sadiya Maqsoom (67438-P)	Respondent No. 02
Dr. Samiaa Rasheed (65273-P)	Respondent No. 03
Hearing dated	12.12.2024

I. FACTUAL BACKGROUND

1. Mr. Muhammad Yaqoob (the "Complainant") filed a complaint on 29.07.2020 against Dr. Abida Yasmeen (the "Respondent No. 1"), who is working as Gynecologist at District Head Quarter Hospital (the "DHQ Hospital"), Chakwal. The complainant submitted that he brought his pregnant wife to the private clinic of Respondent No. 1 on 05.04.2020. Respondent No. 1 informed that delivery would be conducted today. The delivery was conducted and a baby boy was born.



2. Subsequently, Respondent No. 1 referred them to DHQ Hospital Chakwal. The doctor at DHQ, Chakwal told the Complainant to arrange blood. Partial arrangement was made but they then referred the patient to Rawalpindi. During transportation, the patient expired. Complainant requested to take strict action against the Respondent.
3. For context, earlier the present Complainant had submitted an application to the Deputy Commissioner, Chakwal who constituted an inquiry committee on 13.04.2020 and found the Respondent No. 1 guilty and referred the matter for a thorough inquiry by Punjab Healthcare Commission (the "PHC").
4. Thereafter upon referral, the PHC also investigated the matter and gave a decision which was assailed before District & Sessions Judge, Chakwal. This decision of the PHC was set aside to extent of punishment, the case was remanded, directing that punitive action should be in conformity with the gross negligence. Accordingly, PHC re-heard the case and vide order dated 15.11.2021, enhanced the penalty of Rs. 300,000/- and also referred the case of Respondent No. 1 to the PMC for appropriate action.

II. SHOW CAUSE NOTICE ISSUED TO DR. ABIDA YASMEEN, RESPONDENT NO. 1

5. In view of the allegations leveled in the complaint, Show Cause Notice dated 07.07.2021 was served to Dr. Abida Yasmeen in the following terms:

"...

- a. **WHEREAS**, in terms of the facts mentioned and document appended with the complaint, it has been alleged that on 05.04.2020 the Complainant brought his wife to your private clinic where you recommended that the delivery would be carried out on the same day, while it is alleged that the Complainant's wife had no symptoms and labor pains; and
- b. **WHEREAS**, in terms of the facts mentioned and documents appended with the complaint, it is also alleged that immediately after the delivery of the baby you referred the patient to DHQ Hospital, Chakwal without explaining to the family the complication involved and providing them any intimation, referral slip or document; and
- c. **WHEREAS**, in terms of the fact mentioned and the documents appended with the complaint, it is alleged that in the DHQ Hospital, Chakwal, the mother was profusely bleeding therefore



she was referred to Holy Family Hospital, Rawalpindi. However, the patient expired in the ambulance on her way to Rawalpindi; and

- d. **WHEREAS**, in terms of the facts mentioned and the documents appended with the complaint, it has been found that the Deputy Commissioner, Chakwal on 13-04-2020 held an inquiry into the matter by constituting inquiry committee which gave findings on your negligence, giving reasons that the patient/mother was profusely bleeding and was in critical condition and she was referred to DHQ Hospital, Chakwal from your private clinic without any history or relevant record and the same later resulted in the patient's death; and
- e. **WHEREAS**, in terms of the facts mentioned and documents appended with the Complaint it is failure on your part to fulfill your professional responsibilities towards your patient. Such conduct is breach of code of ethics and amounts to professional Negligence/Misconduct. ...”

III. REPLY OF RESPONDENT NO. 1, DR. ABIDA YASMEEN

6. The Respondent No. 1, Dr. Abida Yasmeen submitted her comments on 04.08.2021, wherein she contended that:

- a. The patient Maryam, wife of Muhammad Yaqoob came with term pregnancy labour pains on 05.04.2020 (Sunday). She never sought regular medical check-up. Her husband was insistent that she should be treated by me at the clinic which was closed on Sunday morning and she had previous normal deliveries.
- b. The patient (wife of complainant) was provided every possible care and she delivered a healthy alive baby boy. Prompt treatment was given to control post-partum bleeding and transfer of the patient to DHQ Hospital, Chakwal was suggested. The Complainant resorted the help of DHQ Hospital, Chakwal and the patient was referred to Holy Family Hospital, Rawalpindi afterwards by the duty doctor.
- c. In response to an earlier application by the Complainant, the Deputy Commissioner, Chakwal also constituted an inquiry committee which investigated this matter thoroughly. The report of this inquiry committee clearly manifests that no absolute responsibility has been attributed to her. Initially, the Deputy Commissioner of Chakwal perhaps to assuage the anguish of the Complainant directed the matter to the Secretary, Primary and Secondary Health Care Department, however, after affording opportunity of personal hearing to me, withdrew his directions. The incident is surely painful and pathetic. I did all my best and provided full medical assistance.



- d. *The matter has already been disposed of by the Punjab Healthcare Commission and according to the law of double jeopardy, a person cannot be punished twice for the same matter.*

IV. REJOINDER OF THE COMPLAINANT

7. The reply received from Respondent No. 1, Dr. Abida Yasmeen was forwarded to Complainant through a letter dated 16.8.2021 for rejoinder. The Complainant submitted rejoinder on 12.10.2021, wherein he reiterated his allegations and previously held stance as mentioned in his complaint, denying the reply of Respondent No. 1.

V. HEARING OF THE DISCIPLINARY COMMITTEE DATED 03.06.2022

8. The matter was fixed for hearing before the Disciplinary Committee on 03.06.2022. The complainant appeared whereas the Respondent No. 1 doctor remained absent. Disciplinary Committee in its immediate past hearing on 03.06.2022 directed that additional Show Cause Notices be issued to Respondent No. 2 & 3. The directions of the Disciplinary Committee are as under:

"... Patient was treated by Dr. Sadiya and Dr. Samiya at DHQ Hospital in critical condition in absence of any senior doctor and gynecologist and apparently no proper management of patient was done at the DHQ Hospital. Later, the patient was referred to Holy Family Hospital, Rawalpindi, however, she died on the way. ... Therefore, keeping in view the sudden death of the patient and allegations levelled by the Complainant against the doctors of DHQ Hospital, the Disciplinary Committee directs to issue Show Cause Notices to Dr. Sadiya and Dr. Samiya at DHQ Hospital, Chakwal as their evidence and the record of treatment will be relevant for doing complete justice. ..."

VI. SHOW CAUSE NOTICE TO DR. SADIA MAQSOOM, RESPONDENT NO. 2

9. In view of the directions of the Disciplinary Committee dated 03.06.2022, Show Cause Notice dated 22.08.2022 was served to Dr. Sadia, in the following terms:

"...

- a. **WHEREAS**, a Complaint has been filed by Mr. Muhammad Yaqoob (hereinafter referred to as the "Complainant") on 22.06.2021 before the Disciplinary Committee of Pakistan Medical Commission (herein after referred to as the "Complaint") which is attached as Annex I and shall be read as an integral part of this notice, and



- b. **WHEREAS**, in terms of the facts mentioned in the Complaint it is alleged that, on 05.04.2020, the Complainant brought his wife Mst. Maryam Shaheen (27yrs) to private clinic of Dr. Abida Yasmeen (working as Gynecologist at DHQ Hospital, Chakwal) for the purpose of delivery. Delivery was carried out on the same day and a baby boy was delivered; and
- c. **WHEREAS**, in terms of the facts and record available, it is further alleged that after the delivery at private clinic of Dr. Abida, the patient was referred to DHQ Hospital Chakwal on 05:04 2020, where you were the treating doctor. It is further alleged that you asked the attendants for arrangement of blood, which was arranged by the attendants. Subsequently, you referred the patient to Holy Family Hospital, Rawalpindi without completing the referral procedure i.e., transfusion of blood and management of critical patient. The patient passed away in ambulance while on her way to Rawalpindi, and
- d. **WHEREAS**, in terms of the facts and available record, it is observed that the Deputy Commissioner, Chakwal on 13.04.2020 held an inquiry into the matter by constituting inquiry committee who also gave findings that "at DHQ hospital the behavior of the duty doctor and staff towards the patient's attendant was not courteous and they referred the critical patient to Rawalpindi without completing the procedure of blood transfusion"; and
- e. **WHEREAS**, on 07.07.2021, Show Cause Notice was issued to Dr. Abida Yasmeen in the matter of Complaint and hearing was held on 03.06.2022 before the Disciplinary Committee of Pakistan Medical Commission. The Disciplinary Committee after hearing the parties observed that apparently you as treating doctor of the patient at DHQ Hospital, Chakwal failed to fulfill your professional responsibilities. It was further observed during the bearing that referral of the patient was made by you without completing referral formalities. Prima facie you failed to perform your obligation of duty of care towards patient which led to severe complications and further death of the patient. Such conduct is, prima facie, in violation of the Code of Ethics of Practice for medical and dental practitioners, Regulations, 2011 in general and Regulation 4, 21 (1), 49 (a) & 50 in particular, and ...”

VII. REPLY OF RESPONDENT No. 2, DR. SADIA MAQSOOM

10. The Respondent No. 2, Dr. Sadia Maqsoom submitted her reply on 20.09.2022, wherein she contended that:

- a. *She is a fully qualified doctor having requisite qualifications and dignified work experience to her credit.*



- b. *The Prime Minister of Pakistan through Notification No. 1563(1)/2022 dated 19.8.2022 has withdrawn the nominations of the members of the Medical and Dental Council. Thus, there is no Council empowered to look after the affairs, hence, the instant show cause notice of your good office is liable to be dropped on this score alone.*
- c. *Nothing has been found against me in any of the proceedings/ litigation mentioned hereinabove. Therefore, this complaint is just an attempt to harass and blackmail me*
- d. *The Patient was received by me in a state of shock at labour room of the DHQ, Chakwal on 05.04.2020 at 04:15pm. Patient delivered at and was referred from private clinic of Respondent No. 1 with referral slip or any medical record. Patient was in shock (BP: 90-60) with very heavy post-partum hemorrhage (PPH). Assessment and initial management of patient was done and samples and blood grouping were sent to the labs.*
- e. *Respondent No. 3, Dr. Samia, being on call Consultant for Sunday, was informed on phone regarding serious condition of patient who reached at 05:30pm. Double IV lines were passed, fluid resuscitation was done, catheter was passed and patient was further explored. Stitches were taken, vaginal packing was done and initial medical and surgical management for PPH was done.*
- f. *High risk condition of the patient was conveyed to the attendants and accordingly consent was taken as patient was in grade-III shock with PPH and in DIC.*
- g. *Blood bank was called up for availability of 'A-ve' blood which was unavailable. Arranged blood, nearly a pint, was transfused on 06:30pm, however, no further blood could be arranged. Accordingly, at around 06:45pm, patient was referred to tertiary care Hospital, Rawalpindi for further management and the attendants were duly informed.*
- h. *1122 Ambulance was called for at around 07:00pm, which arrived at DHQ Hospital, Chakwal at 07:50pm. However, during the transportation of the patient, she expired.*

VIII. NOTICE ISSUED TO DR. SAMIAA RASHEED RESPONDENT No. 3

11. In view of the directions of the Disciplinary Committee dated 03.06.2022, Show Cause Notice dated 22.08.2022 was served to Dr. Samiaa Rasheed, in the following terms:

“... ”

- a. **WHEREAS**, a Complaint has been filed by Mr. Muhammad Yaqoob (hereinafter referred to as the "Complainant") on 22.06.2021 before the Disciplinary Committee of Pakistan Medical Commission (hereinafter referred to as the "Complaint") which is attached as Annex I and shall be read as an integral part of this notice; and



- b. **WHEREAS**, in terms of the facts mentioned in the Complaint and available record, it is alleged that on 05.04.2020, the Complainant brought his wife Mst. Maryam Shaheen (27yrs) to private clinic of Dr. Abida Yasmeen (working as Gynecologist at DHQ Hospital, Chakwal) for the purpose of delivery. Delivery was carried out on the same day and a baby boy was delivered; and
- c. **WHEREAS**, in terms of the facts and available record, it is further alleged that after the delivery at private clinic of Dr. Abida, the patient was referred to DHQ Hospital Chakwal on 05.04.2020, where you were the treating doctor. It is further alleged that you asked the attendants for arrangement of blood, which was arranged by the attendants Subsequently, you referred the patient to Holy Family Hospital, Rawalpindi without completing the referral procedure Le transfusion of blood and management of critical patient. The patient passed away in ambulance while on her way to Rawalpindi, and
- d. **WHEREAS**, in terms of the facts and available record, it is observed that the Deputy Commissioner, Chakwal on 13.04.2020 held an inquiry into the matter by constituting inquiry committee who also gave findings that "at DHQ hospital the behavior of the duty doctor and staff towards the patient's attendant was not courteous and they referred the critical patient to Rawalpindi without completing the procedure of blood transfusion"; and
- e. **WHEREAS**, on 07.07.2021, Show Cause Notice was issued to Dr. Abida Yasmeen in the matter of Complaint and hearing was held on 03.06.2022 before the Disciplinary Committee of Pakistan Medical Commission. The Disciplinary Committee after hearing the parties observed that apparently you as treating doctor of the patient at DHQ Hospital, Chakwal failed to fulfill your professional responsibilities. It was further observed during the hearing that referral of the patient was made by you without completing referral formalities. Prima fane you failed to perform your obligation of duty of care towards patient which led to severe complications and further death of the patient. Such conduct is, prima facie, in violation of the Code of Ethics of Practice for medical and dental practitioners, Regulations, 2011 in general and Regulation 4, 21 (1), 49 (a) & 50 in particular, and ...”

IX. REPLY OF RESPONDENT No. 3, DR. SAMIAA RASHEED

12. The Respondent No. 3, Dr. Samiaa Rasheed submitted identical response, to that of the Respondent No. 2 on 20.09.2022, wherein she stated that:

- a. *She is a fully qualified doctor having requisite qualifications and dignified work experience to her credit.*



- b. *The Prime Minister of Pakistan through Notification No. 1563(1)/2022 dated 19.8.2022 has withdrawn the nominations of the members of the Medical and Dental Council. Thus, there is no Council empowered to look after the affairs, hence, the instant show cause notice of your good office is liable to be dropped on this score alone.*
- c. *Nothing has been found against me in any of the proceedings/litigation mentioned hereinabove. Therefore, this complaint is just an attempt to harass and blackmail me*
- d. *The Patient was received by me in a state of shock at labour room of the DHQ, Chakwal on 05.04.2020 at 04:15pm. Patient delivered at and was refereed from private clinic of Respondent No. 1 with referral slip or any medical record. Patient was in shock (BP: 90-60) with very heavy post-partum hemorrhage (PPH). Assessment and initial management of patient was done and samples and blood grouping were sent to the labs.*
- e. *Respondent No. 3, Dr. Samia, being on call Consultant for Sunday, was informed on phone regarding serious condition of patient who reached at 05:30pm. Double IV lines were passed, fluid resuscitation was done, catheter was passed and patient was further explored. Stitches were taken, vaginal packing was done and initial medical and surgical management for PPH was done.*
- f. *High risk condition of the patient was conveyed to the attendants and accordingly consent was taken as patient was in grade-III shock with PPH and in DIC.*
- g. *Blood bank was called up for availability of 'A-ve' blood which was unavailable. Arranged blood, nearly a pint, was transfused on 06:30pm, however, no further blood could be arranged. Accordingly, at around 06:45pm, patient was referred to tertiary care Hospital, Rawalpindi for further management and the attendants were duly informed.*
- h. *1122 Ambulance was called for at around 07:00pm, which arrived at DHQ Hospital, Chakwal at 07:50pm. However, during the transportation of the patient, she expired.*

X. HEARING OF THE DISCIPLINARY COMMITTEE DATED 10.10.2022

13. The matter was fixed for hearing before the Disciplinary Committee on 10.10.2022. The complainant appeared whereas the Respondent doctor No. 1 remained absent and Respondent doctors No. 2 and No. 3 were present, in person. The directions of the Disciplinary Committee at the date of hearing are, as under:

"... It is noteworthy that management of this patient was done by Respondent No. 1 Dr. Abida Yasmeen and later by Respondent No. 2 Dr. Sadia and Respondent No. 3 Dr. Samia. Since Respondent No. 1 Dr. Abida Yasmeen has failed to appear before the Committee, the Disciplinary Committee decides to grant one last opportunity to Dr. Abida Yasmeen to appear for personal



hearing whenever and wherever the next meeting/hearing is scheduled, failing which the matter shall be decided ex-parte on the basis of available record. ...”

XI. SECOND REJOINDER OF THE COMPLAINANT

14. Subsequent to the impleading of Respondent No. 2 and No. 3 into the instant case by the Disciplinary Committee through order dated 03.06.2022, their respective replies were sent to the Complainant on 21.09.2022 for rejoinder. Complainant denied the reply of Respondents.

XII. IMMEDIATE PAST HEARING

15. The matter was earlier heard on 03.05.2024, where the Complainant appeared in person, however, none of the Respondent appeared. Accordingly, the matter was adjourned providing a last opportunity to the Respondents Dr. Abida Yasmeen, Dr. Sadiya Maqsoom and Dr. Samiaa Rasheed, to appear before this forum.

XIII. PRESENT HEARING

16. The matter was fixed for hearing before the Disciplinary Committee for 12.12.2024. Notices dated 04.12.2024 were issued to the Complainant and the Respondent, directing them to appear before the Disciplinary Committee on 12.12.2024. The Complainant was present in person, as were Dr. Sadiya Maqsoom and Dr. Samiaa Rasheed (Respondent No. 02 and No. 03). However, Dr. Abida Yasmeen (Respondent No. 01) did not appear before the Disciplinary Committee, despite service of notice.

17. The Complainant reiterated the contents of his written complaint and additionally placing his reliance on the Inquiry conducted by the Deputy Commissioner, Chakwal and the proceedings before the Punjab Healthcare Commission, Lahore. He stated that both these forums had conducted proceedings and found the doctors had lapsed in their duty, while treating the patient.

18. Respondent No. 2, Dr. Sadiya Maqsoom stated that the Patient was received by her in a state of shock at labour room of the DHQ, Chakwal on 05.04.2020 at 04:15pm. Patient had delivered and was referred from private clinic of Respondent No. 1 without referral slip or any medical record. Patient was in shock with very heavy post-partum hemorrhage (PPH). Initial



assessment and treatment of the patient was done and due to unavailability of 'A-negative' blood at the DHQ, Chakwal, patient was referred at 6:45PM to Benazir Hospital, Rawalpindi.

19. Respondent No. 3, Dr. Samiaa Rasheed stated similar facts as earlier narrated by her colleague before the Disciplinary Committee. She stated that due to appropriate treatment and care of the patient was done by her and due to the unavailability of 'A-negative' blood at the Hospital, the patient was referred to tertiary care at Benazir Hospital, Rawalpindi. Unfortunately, the patient succumbed during the travel to Rawalpindi.

XIV. EXPERT OPINION

20. An Expert of Gynecology was appointed to assist the Disciplinary Committee in this matter. The Expert opined in the instant matter, as under:

“... Dr. Sadiq Maqsoom and Dr. Samiaa Rasheed took half-hearted, measures to save life. Heavily bleeding patient was referred to Rawalpindi without realizing that the patient will die on the way. Both doctors could have called anesthetist and surgeon to remove the uterus. Her life might have been saved by the intervention instead referring bleeding case to Rawalpindi...”

XV. FINDINGS AND CONCLUSION

21. The Disciplinary Committee has perused the relevant record, heard the submissions of the parties at length and considered the expert opinion in the instant Complaint. It is noted that the patient was initially treated by Respondent No. 1, Dr. Abida Yasmeen at her private clinic in Chakwal. The patient delivered a healthy baby but was referred to DHQ Hospital, Chakwal by Dr. Abida. The patient was received, profusely bleeding, in dire condition at the DHQ Hospital, Chakwal and was treated by the Respondent No. 2 and Respondent No. 3. High-risk consent was signed due to absence of the Complainant, by his cousin.

22. It is unfortunate to note that a critical patient treated by the Respondent No. 2 and Respondent No. 3 was handled without mindfulness. A patient suffering from PPH could have been treated by calling a surgeon or anesthetist, aiming to save the life of the patient. Such should have been the instant reflex any doctor when a case of PPH is brought to her attention. The patient had previous history of successful deliveries at the DHQ Hospital, Chakwal and had live children.



Both the Respondent No. 2 and Respondent No. 3 have individual post-graduate qualifications in Gynecology and failed to explore other options to protect the life of the patient including life-saving surgery to stop the bleeding, including but not limited to, the possibility of removing the uterus of the patient.

23. As in the instant case, when the doctor is presented with the possibility of uterus conservation or saving of life, the only choice should be to save the life. The patient suffering from PPH was presented before Dr. Sadia and Dr. Samiaa arrived after nearly 45 minutes, being on-call. In such cases, every minute is important and being a District Headquarter, other qualified gynecologists could have been immediately rushed to stop the bleeding, at all costs.
24. Keeping in view the statement of the parties, the available record and the opinion of the Expert, the Disciplinary Committee is of the unanimous view that both Dr. Sadia Maqsoom (Respondent No. 2) and Dr. Samiaa Rasheed (Respondent No. 03) were negligent while treating a critical patient at a public district Hospital, without paying heed to the life of the patient they were treating and simply referring the patient to another Hospital, without consideration to the life and logistics of this transfer. Accordingly, it is recommended that the medical license of Dr. Sadia Maqsoom (67438-P) be suspended for a period of one (01) year and the medical license of Dr. Samiaa Rasheed (65273-P) be suspended for a period of one (01) year. The instant matter to the extent of Dr. Dr. Sadia Maqsoom (67438-P) and Dr. Samiaa Rasheed (65273-P) is concluded.
25. As for the case regarding Dr. Abida Yasmeen (12964-P), her willful disregard to the present and previous written intimations to appear before the Disciplinary Committee of Pakistan Medical and Dental Council are evident. Keeping in view her irrelevant written response to the notice of hearing today, instead of her required appearance, it is recommended that the medical license of Dr. Abida Yasmeen (12964-P) be suspended, until she appears before the Disciplinary Committee. Adjourned.

Prof. Dr. Muhammad Zubair Khan
Chairman

____ January, 2025